



Minutes
Architectural Review Board
September 10, 2018
Council Chambers, City Hall
Fredericksburg, Virginia

Members Present

Jonathan Gerlach, Chair
Kerri S. Barile
Susan Pates
Karen Irvin
James Whitman

Members Absent

Sabina Weitzman, Vice Chair
Carthon Davis, III

Staff

Kate Schwartz
Camilla Jacobs
Cathy Eckles
Mike Craig
Susanna Finn

Mr. Gerlach called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

OPENING REMARKS

Mr. Gerlach determined that a quorum of five (5) members was present, Carthon Davis III and Sabina Weitzman were absent, and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz noted that they had, but that COA 2018-54 in the public notice had now been deferred until the next public meeting on October 8.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

No changes or additions were made to the agenda. Dr. Barile commented that she thought numerous individuals were here to comment on COA 2018-54, which was removed from the agenda, and suggested we take public comments at the beginning of the evening since this item has been removed. No public comments.

Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the agenda as written. Ms. Barile seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Gerlach asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the regular meeting dated August 13, 2018. There were no changes or additions. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the minutes as written. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

Mr. Gerlach asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the supplementary meeting dated August 27, 2018. There were no changes or additions. Mr. Whitman made a motion to approve the minutes as written. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had engaged in any *ex parte* communication on any item before the Board. Ms. Pates disclosed that she had a discussion with Cathy Herndon regarding 316-318 Charles Street, but that she will be able to discuss the application.

Dr. Barile noted that with regard to COA 2018-64, Dovetail was on the previous project team and had been contracted to perform archaeological study, but that they were not involved in the project at this time. No other Board members had any *ex parte* communication to report.

DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board. Ms. Pates noted that she has a conflict with COA 2016-63 at 100 Wolfe Street and won't be participating.

PUBLIC HEARING

A. Continued Items

- i. **COA 2018-57 – 316-318 Charles Street** – Patrick Gay requests to construct a rooftop addition and make alterations to this commercial building, including changing windows and doors and applying stucco to wall surfaces, in order to convert it to a mixed-use property.

The applicant was not present.

Cathy Herndon, 408 Frederick Street, spoke with regard to her concerns about the height of the roof and noted that she had not received a mailed notice about the project. Mr. Gerlach questioned the notice requirement, but Ms. Schwartz explained that there is no requirement for mailed notice for alterations, only new construction.

Discussion ensued regarding the changes made after comments and suggestions that were made on August 13 and questions were asked about what all could be done without the applicant present. Numerous comments were made about setting back the second story elevation on both the front and the back. Without the applicant present, a continuation was considered. Dr. Barile suggested that the design could be approved with conditions and the applicant could return for a modification if the decision is not amenable to them. Ms. Schwartz suggested maintaining the existing roof with a gap of no less than 3 feet on the front and rear elevations at the second story.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations in accordance with the drawings dated August 30, 2018 on condition that the second floor addition on the west and east elevations are pulled in no less than 3 feet to create a separation between the original walls and the addition to maintain its current roofline. Ms. Irvin seconded and the motion carried 5-0.

B. New Business

Accessory Structures:

- i. **COA 2018-59 – 203 Princess Elizabeth Street** – Melissa Colombo requests to construct a one-story detached garage accessory structure on the west side of this single-family residence.

The applicant, Melissa Colombo, was present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Pates questioned the alignment and size of the garage and asked if it could be set back further. Ms. Colombo said the structure cannot be moved without encroaching on the rear setback. Discussion ensued regarding the measurements and the allowable numbers. Ms. Pates stated she could not support this structure even though it meets the guidelines due to its size. Further discussion ensued regarding the setbacks and zoning requirements. Mr. Gerlach noted that the structure was large, but that nothing in the ARB's guidelines prohibited this design.

Mr. Whitman made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the accessory structure as submitted. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 4-1, with Ms. Pates opposed.

- ii. **COA 2018-65 – 230 Princess Anne Street** – Elizabeth Sale requests to construct a wood pergola in the rear yard of this single-family residence.

The applicant, Elizabeth Sale, was present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Irvin asked for clarification of the property lines as shown in the drawing and the position of the accessory structure. Ms. Sale explained the exact position of the structure.

Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the request as submitted. Ms. Pates seconded. Motion carried 5-0.

Exterior Alterations:

- iii. **COA 2018-58 – 132 Caroline Street** – Ed Sandtner requests to replace the porch decking and porch stair treads with synthetic decking at this single-family residence.

The applicant Ed Sandtner, was present. Mr. Sandtner described the issues he has experienced with water infiltration at this porch and said he has replaced the porch materials in kind with wood two times previously. There was no public comment.

Ms. Pates said she doesn't understand why the applicant has had issues using wood. Discussion ensued regarding the conditions of the project and the previous two replacements. Ms. Pates noted that she would not support the application. Dr. Barile said that she was disappointed in the use of synthetic materials, but that the applicant has shown enough information to merit the change in material.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the request as submitted. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- iv. **COA 2018-60 – 807 Caroline Street** – Melissa Colombo requests to remove the wood steps at the rear elevation of this mixed-use building and rebuild the porches at the second and third floors.

The applicant, Melissa Colombo, was present. There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile complimented the simple design and informative packet. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as presented. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- v. **COA 2018-61 – 307 Lafayette Boulevard** – Muller Design Company, LLC requests to make alterations to this commercial building, including installing building signage and lighting fixtures and replacing windows on the two-story rear addition.

The applicant, Kerrin Muller, was present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Pates clarified that on the rear addition, vinyl windows would be removed and wood windows would be installed. Ms. Muller said this was correct. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the

alterations in accordance with the recommendations made in the staff report. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- vi. **COA 2018-62 – 2201 Caroline Street** – The City of Fredericksburg Public Facilities Division requests to install a roof-mounted HVAC unit on the bathroom building at Old Mill Park.

Ray Regan, Division Manager for the City's Public Facilities Division, was present to represent the application. Mr. Regan described the flood conditions at this site and clarified that the roof-mounted HVAC would be placed two feet above the gutter level. There was no public comment.

Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- vii. **COA 2018-63 – 100 Wolfe Street** – William B. Tucker requests to make alterations to this residence, which has been converted to commercial use, including reconstructing the rear wall, altering the rear entry door and one window, and replacing an awning.

The applicant, William Tucker, was present. There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile commented that the new curved glass awning design at the rear of the building seemed incongruous. Mr. Tucker said they were looking for an awning silhouette that required less depth. Mr. Tucker said they would be willing to look at a different style and continue this portion of the application. Ms. Irvin and the applicant discussed the existing rear windows at the second floor and clarified that no changes would be made to the jalousie windows at this time.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted with the exception of the awning over the rear door which shall be tabled for a future meeting. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 4-0-1, with Ms. Pates abstaining.

- viii. **COA 2018-64 – 100, 106, and 108 Hanover Street and 714-718 Sophia Street** – Burt Pinnock requests to demolish the existing commercial buildings at 106 and 108 Hanover Street and requests approval of the site planning, scale, and massing of a new, mixed-use, three-and-one-half-story building

The applicant and project architect, Burt Pinnock of Baskervill, was present.

Public comments were heard from:

Tom Smith, 1310 Kenmore Ave and an adjoining property owner, who commented that he has followed various projects on the site since 2004. He is very impressed with this, namely the innovative concepts and adaptations, the forward thinking with historical sensitivity, the mixed materials, and the mixed uses of the building. He believes the placement is well-suited with Riverfront Park being right across the street.

Danae Peckler, 1410 Prince Edward Street, who commented that she feels the project is an improvement on past projects, but should have more setbacks and set-ins in order to give the appearance of separate buildings and not so many solid straight lines. She said she would prefer if the design that was submitted in June was brought back.

Ed Sandtner, 132 Caroline, who agreed with Ms. Peckler that breaking up the massing of the structure would improve the design. He complimented the architect on reflecting historic character, but said the stone “tower” on Hanover Street was discordant.

Dr. Barile discussed some of the speakers’ comments and questioned the stone “tower” as a component of the design. Mr. Pinnock said this was the stair tower accessible to the public and the cladding had been chosen to help this feature look like an evolution in time. Further discussion ensued regarding the footprint/square footage of the project in relation to other buildings downtown. The current project is 163 x 28 square feet for a total of 18,000 square feet. Dr. Barile asked if firewalls could be installed above the roofline to divide the massing. Mr. Pinnock described the historic massing precedents used for the design and said the intention was to keep the design simple.

Mr. Gerlach expressed concerns about demolition of the current buildings until a final design has been approved. Ms. Schwartz noted that the Board can make the demolition contingent upon the final architectural design being approved, or upon the final site plan approval. Mr. Gerlach also recommended that disclosure of the discovery of any archeological finds be included in the final approval of this project.

Ms. Pates said she had voted against the demolition of existing structures previously and would again. She stated her approval of the foundation and design of the structure and feels it fits in to Fredericksburg, but would like to see samples of the brick and stone. Mr. Gerlach did have some questions regarding the speakers’ comments about the setbacks and wondered if it was possible to incorporate some on Sophia Street. Mr. Pinnock discussed that all things are possible but that the design was intentional and he was reluctant to create the appearance of smaller buildings rather than an industrial-scale building. Mr. Gerlach agreed and commented that it does fit in well with this warehouse commercial district part of Fredericksburg.

Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the site planning, scale, and massing proposed for the new construction, and approve the demolition of the existing commercial buildings conditional upon final approval of the architectural elements. The Board decided to split this into two separate decisions.

Ms. Irvin withdrew her motion and made a new motion to approve the site planning, scale, and massing of the new construction on Hanover and Sophia Streets as submitted. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

Ms. Irvin then motioned to approve demolition of the structures at 106-108 Hanover Street contingent upon final approval of the architectural details of the new construction. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 4-1, with Ms. Pates against.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Danae Peckler, 1410 Prince Edward Street, cited the street frontage lengths of several other large downtown buildings including the Marriott, Executive Plaza, and the Courthouse, and said the new project at Hanover and Sophia Streets would be longer at 163 feet.

OTHER BUSINESS

A. Recommendation for Area 6/Maker District Contributing Historic Structures.

Mike Craig, Senior Planner, gave a power point presentation regarding Area 6 and discussion ensued regarding the maker district, transfer of development rights (TDR), and the corridors. Mr. Gerlach questioned whether the historic district was being expanded. Ms. Schwartz stated it was not at this time. Mr. Craig said any steps toward becoming a historic district would have to come from within the neighborhood.

Mr. Gerlach then questioned the addition of some new buildings. Ms. Schwartz did receive an email from Mr. Davis wanting to add the Quarles Building and the Economy Food Mart on Fall Hill Avenue. Mr. Craig then explained that although those buildings were in the Area 6, they were not in the Maker District portion of Area 6. However if the Board wishes to add these to a local inventory of historic properties, they can include them in the list. Ms. Pates discussed the transfer of development rights and why she feels Princess Anne should not be in the maker district plan, even though she wants to preserve the buildings. Mr. Craig noted that there would be no prohibition on demolition, but that inclusion in the local inventory would make these historic buildings eligible for the TDR program.

Dr. Barile said she supported adding the Quarles building, which was built as the Pratt Clinic, to the list because it fits with the ideology and theme of the former hospital building and other medical offices.

Dr. Barile made a motion to adopt the list of contributing historic structures for Area 6 with the addition of the Quarles building and Economy Food Mart building on Fall Hill Avenue and include them in the local inventory of historic structures. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- B. Transmittal of Planning Commission Agenda – September 12, 2018.
There were no comments or questions from the Board.

STAFF UPDATE

Mr. Craig announced that a 5:30 p.m. work session would be held with the City Council, Planning Commission, and ARB on Tuesday, September 11 in order to meet with the consultant Streetsense as part of the Downtown Small Area Plan. A public meeting will be held at 7:30 p.m. the same night.

COMMITTEE UPDATE

None

CHAIRMAN'S REPORT

None

ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Whitman made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Dr. Barile seconded. Motion carried 5-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:10 p.m.



Jonathan Gerlach, ARB Chair