



**Minutes**  
**Architectural Review Board**  
June 11, 2018  
Council Chambers, City Hall  
Fredericksburg, Virginia

**Members Present**

Jonathan Gerlach, Chair  
Susan Pates  
Kerri S. Barile  
Carthon Davis, III  
Karen Irvin  
James Whitman

**Members Absent**

Sabina Weitzman, Vice Chair

**Staff**

Kate Schwartz  
Camilla Jacobs

---

Mr. Gerlach called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

**OPENING REMARKS**

Mr. Gerlach determined that a quorum of six members was present and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz stated that they had.

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Ms. Schwartz informed the board that two applications were being withdrawn:

- COA 2018-29 at 100, 106, and 108 Hanover Street and 714-718 Sophia Street
- COA 2018-40 at 403 Hanover Street

Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the agenda as written. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Mr. Gerlach asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the regular meeting dated May 14, 2018. There were no changes or additions. Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the minutes as written. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

**DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had engaged in any *ex parte* communication on any item before the Board. No Board members had any *ex parte* communication to report.

**DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board. Ms. Pates stated she would not participate in any discussions regarding COA 2018-39 at 1111 Princess Anne Street as she was the real estate broker for the property.

**PUBLIC HEARING**

**A. New Business**  
**Signs**

- i. **COA 2018-31 – 1009 Princess Anne Street** - Matthew R. Scott requests to install signs, including one projecting sign, for The Sourcery retail business.

The applicant, Matthew Scott, was not present. There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile asked staff to clarify the location of the sign bracket. Ms. Schwartz noted that it would be centered in the panel above the door. Mr. Gerlach asked about the text style and color of the painted sign. Ms. Schwartz noted that the Board's practice was to refrain from discussing the content of signs in accordance with recent changes to the City's sign ordinance. Mr. Gerlach asked Ms. Schwartz not to include the guidelines related to content in future staff reports.

Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the application as presented. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- ii. **COA 2018-32 – 1008 Sophia Street** - Deborah Franks requests to install signs, including one building-mounted sign, for the MANARC retail store.

The applicant, Deborah Franks, was not present. There was no public comment.

Mr. Davis asked for clarification regarding the material of the sign and the staff recommendation regarding framing. Ms. Schwartz referenced the staff report stating that the sign should be framed appropriately to ensure that the wooden face will not warp and deteriorate due to exposure. Additionally, the sign should be mounted to stand off from the siding to ensure that debris and moisture do not accumulate behind the sign and cause the weatherboard siding to deteriorate. Mr. Davis added that the framing should fully cover the plywood edges and the sign should be constructed of pressure-treated lumber.

Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the application on condition that the sign is supported by a frame made of dimensional lumber, that the frame covers the sign's edges, and the sign is constructed of pressure treated wood. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- iii. **COA 2018-36 – 301 Lafayette Boulevard** - Micah Mossman requests to install signs, including one building-mounted sign and one projecting sign, for Pueo Business Solutions, LLC.

The applicant, Micah Mossman, was present. There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the application as presented on condition that the sign is attached through the mortar joints of the building. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

#### **Fences/Accessory Structures**

- v. **COA 2018-33 – 706 Prince Edward Street** – Michael J. Corrigan requests to remove the existing chain-link fence and install a six-foot wood privacy fence along the south side property line for this single-family residence.

Rusty Davis was present to represent the applicant. There was no public comment.

Mr. Whitman made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Mr. Davis seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- vi. **COA 2018-35 – 210 Ferdinand Street** – John Russ, on behalf of Fredericksburg City Public Schools, requests to install metal handrails along a set of brick steps in the parking lot.

Mike Christopher was present to represent the applicant. There was no public comment.

Mr. Davis asked if the railings would be painted. Mr. Christopher stated that they would not be painted, they would be a galvanized finish to match the existing railings.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- vii. **COA 2018-38 – 227 Charles Street** – Katherine Maulden requests to install a six-foot wood privacy fence along the rear east property line for this single-family residence.

The applicant, Katherine Maulden, was present. Ms. Maulden stated that they would shorten the length of the fence to 25 feet 2 inches so that the height of the fence could stay within the six-foot limit. She also stated that the fence would be constructed of cedar.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Whitman made a motion to approve the request as presented by the applicant. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

- viii. **COA 2018-39 - 1111 Princess Anne Street** – Nathan Hegna requests to install a three-foot aluminum fence above the brick retaining wall and a four-foot gate at the base of the steps along the north side property line for this single-family residence.

The applicant was not present. There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the request as submitted. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0-1, with Ms. Pates abstaining.

#### **Exterior Alterations**

- ix. **COA 2018-34 – 400 Princess Anne Street** – Maureen Bartosh requests to make exterior alterations, including installing a walk-up service window on the south side elevation, for the 25 30 Espresso coffee shop.

The applicant, Maureen Bartosh, was present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Irvin asked for clarification of where the window would be placed. Ms. Bartosh said it would overlap the current painted sign, but that they are currently planning to repaint the building. She also noted that the proposed awning would match those at the front of the building.

The Board discussed the size and location of the proposed window as well as its alignment with existing windows on the building.

Mr. Gerlach asked about the materials of the window to be installed. Ms. Schwartz noted that the window is aluminum and wood framing would cover the outside edge of the window.

Mr. Davis asked if the new window would align with the second-floor casement windows. Ms. Bartosh said it will generally align with the casement closest to the front of the building.

Dr. Barile suggested that the Board table this application to the next meeting so the applicant could provide a sketch showing the exact location of the window. The pattern of fenestration is an important feature of this building and she said she was concerned about the alignment of the new window. Dr. Barile commented that the Board is typically reluctant to allow applicants to create holes in historic fabric and it's important to take in all data before making this decision.

Ms. Bartosh noted that this commercial building has been modified many times and didn't see how this alteration could create a false sense of history or damage its significance.

Dr. Barile referred to the guidelines and talked about the fenestration of windows. Knowing where the window will be placed and if it will line up with existing windows that are there. She explained the type of details they are looking for.

Discussion continued with Mr. Gerlach, Mr. Davis, and Dr. Barile regarding the new window measurements and alignment as well as alternative window sizes and types.. The applicant commented that the windows on the front of the building are not at all symmetrical.

Ms. Pates asked if this installation could be reversed. The contractor, Mike Huie, said that it could be removed in the future. Dr. Barile noted that the window could be removed, but the original historic fabric would still be gone.

Ms. Pates said she recognizes that this is important to Ms. Bartosh's business and would like to figure out how to make it work. Mr. Gerlach said he is inclined to support this application without any further submission. Ms. Irvin suggested that the new window should align with some element of the windows above. Mr. Davis agreed and provided suggestions.

Mr. Whitman made a motion to approve the application on condition that one side of the window aligns with some portion of the windows above. Mr. Davis suggested a friendly amendment and stated that the new window be aligned with the vertical plane of a second-story window. Mr. Whitman accepted the amendment. Mr. Davis seconded. The motion carried 5-1, with Dr. Barile against.

- x. **COA 2018-37 – 133 Caroline Street** – James McGhee requests to construct a one-story addition attached to the rear elevation of the Sentry Box residence.

The applicant, James McGhee, was present. Mr. McGhee is the project architect. Mr. McGhee provided a presentation of a 3D computer model and photographs of the property. He explained that his intention was to retain visibility of the original gable roof and would not be touching any of the existing historic fabric. He said the existing additions have very ~~messing~~ messy roofing details,

so he was trying to create consistency and uniformity for both appearance and drainage purposes. He noted that all additions will be reversible.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Gerlach clarified that they were considering the site planning, mass, and scale and that Mr. McGhee would return for consideration of the architectural details.

Dr. Barile noted that she has worked with the property owner on a regular and ongoing basis on archaeological investigation of the property. She said she would recuse herself from the application to avoid a conflict of interest.

Mr. McGhee said that the design would incorporate a continuous trim detail at the eave line for all new elements and provided a material sample. Mr. Gerlach noted that this was technically a detail element, but asked if any Board members had any concerns with this detail. No one voiced any concerns.

Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the site planning, scale, and massing as submitted. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 5-0-1, with Dr. Barile abstaining.

Mr. Davis made a motion to continue consideration of the architectural details to the July 9, 2018 meeting. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 5-0-1, with Dr. Barile abstaining.

- xi. **COA 2018-41 – 207 Caroline Street** – Sean Haynes requests to construct a two-story addition attached to the rear and north side elevations of this single-family residence and construct a one-story pool house in the rear yard

The applicant, Sean Haynes, was present. Charles Aquino, the project architect was also present.

Danae Peckler, 1410 Prince Edward Street, said that much of the design was very well done, but she was concerned about the scale of the two-story addition and the street-facing garage. She said she would support detailing the addition as a carriage house or reducing the scale.

Mr. Davis reminded applicants that preliminary reviews do not equate to approval from the Board. He said he does not support the front-facing garage as shown, but would consider how it is impacted by changing the detailing. Mr. Gerlach said he shared these concerns and thought the garage was atypical for lower Caroline Street. There was some discussion of garages that have been included with new construction.

The Board discussed ways that the massing of the addition could be differentiated from the primary structure, including altering the roof of the hyphen, adding an overhang to the garage door, and altering other detail elements. An alternate design drawing was shown to the Board.

Ms. Pates recommended a side-loading garage like others on Caroline Street. Mr. Aquino said this wasn't feasible on the site.

Mr. Whitman said he thought the design of the garage was acceptable due to its significant setback. Mr. Gerlach recommended that the application be continued to a work session to evaluate changes to the design details. Mr. Haynes agreed to a session on June 25.

Mr. Davis made a motion to continue the application to a work session on June 25, 2018 at 7 p.m. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

**GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

Danae Peckler, 1410 Prince Edward Street, referred to COA 2018-41 and said she supported changing the detailing of the project to create a distinct hyphen and create an overhang over the garage door. She said she was concerned about including the triple window detail.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

- A. Transmittal of Planning Commission Agenda – June 13, 2018  
There were no comments.
  
- B. Transmittal of Gunnery Site Phase IA Letter Report  
There were no comments.
  
- C. Pre-Application Discussions  
The Board discussed procedures for holding pre-application discussions of projects and determined that better communication was needed for applicants. Mr. Gerlach and Ms. Pates agreed to work on a statement to ensure that applicants understand that these initial reviews do not represent a decision on an application. Ms. Schwartz agreed to gather information on these procedures from other communities and ensure that potential applicants provide documents for review in advance of a meeting.

**STAFF UPDATE**

There was no staff update.

**COMMITTEE UPDATE**

There were no committee updates.

**CHAIRMAN’S REPORT**

Mr. Gerlach noted that the Riverfront Park plans were at the 50% complete stage. He said that Dovetail was working with the City to mitigate any archaeological impacts.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 9:12 p.m.



---

Jonathan Gerlach, ARB Chair