



**Minutes**  
**Architectural Review Board**  
March 12, 2018  
Council Chambers, City Hall  
Fredericksburg, Virginia

**Members Present**

Jonathan Gerlach, Chair  
Sabina Weitzman, Vice Chair  
Susan Pates  
Kerri S. Barile  
Carthon Davis, III  
Karen Irvin  
James Whitman

**Members Absent**

**Staff**

Kate Schwartz  
Camilla Jacobs

---

Mr. Gerlach called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

**OPENING REMARKS**

Mr. Gerlach determined that a quorum of seven members was present and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz stated that they had, with the exception of COA 2018-12 at 506-512 Sophia Street. Mailed notifications to the adjacent property owners had not been sent. As a result, the public hearing would need to be re-advertised for April 9, 2018.

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the agenda as written. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Mr. Gerlach asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the supplementary meeting dated February 26, 2018. There were no changes or additions. Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the minutes as written. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

Mr. Gerlach asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the regular meeting dated February 12, 2018. There were no changes or additions. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the minutes as written. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

**DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had engaged in any *ex parte* communication on any item before the Board. No Board members had any *ex parte* communications to report.

**DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board.

Ms. Pates stated she had a conflict of interest that had been previously disclosed for COA 2018-04 at 306-312 Frederick Street. She was the listing agent for the property's sale.

## **PUBLIC HEARING**

### **A. Continued Items**

- i. **COA 2018-04 – 306-312 Frederick Street** – Michael Adams requests to make alterations to the Kenmore Coffee Warehouse building to convert it to commercial use, including installing windows, doors, metal roofing, and an ADA-accessible ramp, as well as filling in missing sections of brick and trim.

Property owners Michael Adams and Jon Van Zandt were present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Weitzman thanked the applicants for the updates provided and asked about the thickness of the window trim or brick mold. She said it appeared to have been thickened from the original profile. Mr. Van Zandt said that it could be reduced from three to two inches.

Mr. Davis asked about the details of the doors and if the side door would also be a custom door. Mr. Van Zandt said that none of the doors would be standard doors, and that the side door would match the details of the front elevation doors. Mr. Adams said that it would be a three-foot wide door with the balance of the opening filled by a sidelight. He said they had elected not to use a door the full width of the opening because the sidelight design worked.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the application with the conditions recommended in the staff report and with the condition that the brick mold surrounding the new windows will be in keeping with the dimensions of the existing. Mr. Whitman seconded.

Mr. Gerlach restated the motion and said that the following conditions would be included:

1. The parapet of the stair tower will be modified to match the elevation approved by City Council on December 12, 2017;
2. The Historic Resources Planner and one member of the ARB will be permitted to document the existing conditions prior to the removal of materials;
3. The details of any paint removal or cleaning of brick surfaces must be submitted in order to determine if further ARB approval is required; and
4. The brick mold surrounding the new windows will be selected to match the dimensions of the existing as closely as possible.

The motion carried 6-0-1 with Ms. Pates abstaining.

### **B. New Business**

#### **Signs**

- i. **COA 2018-09 – 1108 Caroline Street** – Jacqueline Simmonds requests to install signs, including one building-mounted sign and one projecting sign, for the Pimenta restaurant.

Raymond and Simone Simmonds, 10715 Tricia Place, Fredericksburg, Virginia, 22408, were present to represent the applicant. There was no public comment.

Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the application in accordance with the staff recommendation to ensure that the sign bracket is attached through the building's mortar joints. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

## **Accessory Structures**

- ii. **COA 2018-10 – 500 William Street** – The City of Fredericksburg Parks, Recreation, and Events Department requests to install a prefabricated concrete restroom building in Hurkamp Park.

Mike Ward, Division Manager for the City of Fredericksburg's Parks, Recreation, and Events Department, was present to represent the application. There was no public comment.

Ms. Weitzman asked if the light fixtures had been selected for the project. Mr. Ward said they had not, and also noted that motion sensor lights would be installed at the corners. Ms. Weitzman recommended that he work with staff on the fixture selection and to ensure that the color temperature of the lighting is in the appropriate warm white range.

Dr. Barile noted that a cost proposal for archaeological work had been requested from Dovetail Cultural Resource Group, but that she could maintain impartiality in her consideration of this application.

Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the application in accordance with the staff recommendation, which conditioned approval on compliance with the Minor Site Plan, and recommended that the applicant work with staff on the details of the lighting. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

## **Exterior Alterations**

- iii. **COA 2018-08 – 407-415 Amelia Street & 1101-1103 Prince Edward Street** – John Janney requests to replace the existing aluminum windows in this multi-family building with new composite-clad wood windows.

The applicant, John Janney, was present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Weitzman said that the applicant appears to have made the case for replacement and agreed that the windows do not appear to be repairable. She noted that this was a challenging case and they had to consider if windows that would not meet the district guidelines should be maintained.

Mr. Janney said he would be willing to see if they can reduce the width of the jamb reveal on the new windows to better match the original profile. He noted that the windows were not an architectural choice at the time they were installed. They were a budgetary choice and were the cheapest available at the time. He said he believes they are improving the look of the building with a period-appropriate choice.

Ms. Weitzman noted that she was unclear on the details of the replacement units and wanted to ensure that the window fills the original opening with no fillers or panels. Dr. Barile noted that vinyl or Fibrex windows were not an appropriate material for use. Ms. Schwartz clarified that the window policy allowed for vinyl or Fibrex cladding on the exterior as long as the windows were constructed of solid wood.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve replacement of the windows with a composite-clad wood window on condition that the applicant use the narrowest frame available and ensure that the replacement windows will fill the existing openings with no fillers or panels. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

- iv. **COA 2018-11 – 1306 Sophia Street** – Jason Gallant requests to make alterations to this single-family residence, including replacing the wood and concrete porch steps, replacing handrails and porch decking, parging the foundation wall, and replacing siding on a rear addition.

The property owner, Tammy Hancock, and the project contractor, Jason Gallant, were present to represent the application. There was no public comment.

Ms. Pates asked if any of the decorative elements of the porch would be impacted. Mr. Gallant said that only the decking would be replaced. Mr. Gerlach asked if the applicant had a preference for the decking material. Mr. Gallant said that he had successfully used fir or Azek, but had less confidence in the Aeratis composite. He said that even when prepped well, the fir tends to not hold up well over time.

Ms. Weitzman noted the importance of both appropriate materials and proper installation. She said that given the wood detailing of the existing porch, it makes sense to continue the use of wood for the decking. She also noted that kiln-dried, pressure-treated woods can be painted immediately. Mr. Gallant said he would look at the options.

Mrs. Hancock said that a full renovation of the house had been done in 1996, but that the house had been damaged in the earthquake. They were planning to stabilize and restore the porch, and hoping to use a material that would require a little less maintenance.

Mr. Gerlach asked if they could accept the staff recommendation not to parge the foundation wall. Mrs. Hancock said they could live with it and noted some details about the history of the house.

Ms. Pates asked if they had considered the use of salvaged wood for the front porch. Mr. Gallant said it is possible salvaged materials could be found, but that this isn't really feasible as the salvaged wood would require extensive re-milling to make it work.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the application in accordance with the staff recommendation, which included the following elements:

1. The siding on the 1996 rear addition may be replaced with Hardiplank fiber cement lap siding, LP SmartSide lap siding, or pine lap siding with Boral trim;
2. The existing wood and concrete porch steps may be replaced with new concrete steps as shown on the attached drawing.
3. The existing galvanized pipe handrails may be replaced with new steel handrails as shown on the attached documentation.
4. The front porch decking may be replaced with vertical grain Douglas Fir, Azek, or Aeratis on condition that the replacement material meets the following standards: tongue-and-groove installation, board thickness matching the original material, a smooth surface finish (without extreme faux graining), a finished edge, and a matte or paintable surface.

Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

Dr. Barile made a motion to deny the request to parge the north side brick foundation wall in accordance with the staff recommendation. Mr. Davis seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

#### **Demolition/New Construction**

- v. **COA 2018-12 – 506-512 Sophia Street** – Brendyn Fisher requests to demolish the existing townhomes and requests approval of the site planning, scale, massing, and architectural details of seven three-story townhomes and one four-story apartment building.

Lee Shadbolt, the project architect from Commonwealth Architects, and Steve DeFalco, the property owner, were present to represent the application. Mr. Shadbolt noted the reasons that the heights of the buildings had been increased. He said this was largely to accommodate removing the buildings from the floodplain, but was also a reflection of ceiling heights and an increased roof pitch from 7:12 to 9:12. They provided a response letter to the Board that addressed several of the modifications.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Gerlach noted that because the notice requirements for the application had not been met, the public hearing would be deferred to the April 9, 2018 meeting. The applicants said they understood this, and would also like to schedule a work session with the ARB on March 26.

Mr. Gerlach said he was concerned about reviewing this project without the details of the apartment building. Mr. DeFalco said he doesn't want to commit funding to the design of the condo building at this point because construction of the townhomes will take most of the year. He doesn't want to move forward with an approval that will expire. He said he does not envision major changes to what was approved initially.

Ms. Irvin said that while paint color is not in the ARB's purview, the applicants should ensure that the synthetic materials selected can be painted in the dark colors selected. Some synthetic materials cannot be successfully painted in very dark colors. Mr. Shadbolt thanked Ms. Irvin for her comment and noted that they were aware of that limitation.

Mr. Gerlach noted that his primary concern was the height. Mr. DeFalco explained the constraints of building in the floodplain and the standards they were attempting to meet. Ms. Weitzman said the building appeared to be a full story too tall. Height was a challenge in the Board's previous consideration of the project, but the Board determined that the impact was mitigated by the architectural details. With the additional height, the building is a full story too tall.

Mr. Shadbolt said that the cornice/eave height is the defining factor. The ridge height is a secondary impact because it is less visible, and the eave they are proposing is within a few feet of what was originally proposed. Ms. Irvin noted that they had not provided consistent measurements for where the height was measured and asked for this to be corrected.

Dr. Barile said she had voted against the project in their previous consideration due to height and that adding eight feet to the building was moving in the wrong direction. She noted that

the change also eliminates any continuity with the fenestration patterns of the historic buildings.

Ms. Pates said that the existing buildings were contributing to the district and that people have restored many buildings that are falling down. She said they should be maintained with any new building added behind. She also said that the buildings should be all-brick construction and that she does not support including garages for units four through seven.

Ms. Weitzman and Mr. Shadbolt discussed the grading of the site, the existing slope of the site, and how the eave heights are impacted by these conditions. Mr. Gerlach noted that the primary topic of the upcoming work session would be the heights of the buildings. Ms. Irvin said that the trade-off for gaining the desired flood elevation might have to be the loss of the roof space.

Mr. Davis made a motion to continue the application to a work session on March 26, 2018. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

#### **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

There was no public comment.

#### **OTHER BUSINESS**

A. Transmittal of Planning Commission Agenda for March 14, 2018

There were no comments or questions on the agenda.

#### **STAFF UPDATE**

There was no update from staff.

#### **COMMITTEE UPDATE**

There were no committee updates.

#### **CHAIRMAN'S REPORT**

Mr. Gerlach reported that a joint City Council and Architectural Review Board Working Group would be formed as a follow-up to the joint work session held on February 20, 2018. This nine-member group will include two members from Council, two ARB members, and representatives from HFFI, the UMW Preservation Department, the National Park Service, Main Street, and the local development community. The group will meet monthly to address issues in the historic district. He said updates would be provided to the ARB monthly.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

Mr. Davis made a motion to adjourn. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 7-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:55 p.m.



---

Jonathan Gerlach, ARB Chair