



**Minutes**  
**Architectural Review Board**  
February 13, 2023  
Council Chambers

**You may view and listen to the Architectural Review Board meeting in its entirety [here](#). The time of each presentation is in brackets below [00:00:00].**

**Members Present**

Adriana Moss (Vice Chair)  
Helen P. Ross  
James Jarrell IV  
D.D. Lecky  
Laura Galke  
Kelly Penick

**Members Absent**

Karen Irvin (Chair)

**Staff**

Kate Schwartz  
Caroline Hieber

---

Vice Chair Moss called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

**OPENING REMARKS**

Vice Chair Moss determined that a quorum of 6 members was present, and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz confirmed that they had.

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA** [\[00:01:36\]](#)

Ms. Lecky made a minor correction regarding COA FY23-0039 – 1311 Caroline Street. The description notes the replacement for 11 windows however, the plans include 14 windows. Ms. Ross made a motion to approve the agenda as amended. Ms. Galke seconded and the motion carried 6-0.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS & REPORTS**

None

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES** [\[00:02:50\]](#)

Ms. Lecky motioned to approve the November 14, 2022 minutes as written and Ms. Penick seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

Ms. Galke motioned to approve the November 28, 2022 minutes as written and Ms. Ross seconded. The motion carried 6-0.

**DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

**DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST** [\[00:04:50\]](#)

Mr. Jarrell disclosed a conflict of interest regarding item COA FY23-0033 – 507 Caroline Street and confirmed he submitted a disclosure form to Ms. Schwartz and will recuse himself from discussion.

**CONSENT AGENDA [00:05:50]**

- A. COA FY23-0036 – 1015 Caroline Street – Sign Installation
- B. COA FY23-0037 – 110 Hanover Street – Minor Alteration
- C. COA FY23-0038 – 604 Caroline Street – Sign Installation

Ms. Galke motioned to approve the consent agenda as submitted. Ms. Lecky seconded and the motion carried 6-0.

**PUBLIC HEARING [00:07:34]**

**Continued Applications**

- A. COA FY23-0010 – 301-303 Hanover Street – Kitty Waffle and Jay Holloway request to make alterations including replacing all the windows, demolishing the rear additions at this residential structure, and constructing new rear additions.

Ms. Schwartz provided an overview of the application. Mr. Holloway elaborated on the details of the project. He proposed a partial replacement of the deteriorated windows. The windows will retain the historic brick mold, the interior casing, and the jamb. In regards to the rear addition, restoration was the first instinct but was reconsidered once the damage was evaluated. He proposed to retain the eastern wall and move the openings down a foot. He stated that the western wall needs to be removed for restoration and repairs to the original building. The new addition would be respectful of the original scale and massing.

Danae Peckler, from the Historic Fredericksburg Foundation Inc. (HFFI), spoke in opposition to the demolition and requested additional information for the window assessment prior to approval. She also noted that the north elevation should be included in the discussion.

Mr. Jarrell clarified the components of the application and what was being requested.

Ms. Penick stated that the new addition and materials should mimic the simplicity of the existing structure. The scale and massing should be brought down to align with the existing structure. They should maintain the linkage between the western wall and the existing building. Ms. Penick stated that there are gas meters where the patio is going to be reconfigured and asked if they were going to be relocated. She also requested additional information regarding the trash receptacles in the new parking lot and how they would be screened.

Mr. Holloway stated that they are working with a landscape architect and will return with additional information. The gas meters are going to be relocated.

Ms. Lecky asked several clarifying questions about the details of the replacement window units. The proposed alterations are two sashes, top and bottom, and a very thin pocket jamb which is  $\frac{3}{4}$  of an inch thick. Ms. Lecky agreed with the staff recommendation to retain the east wall of the east addition and the west wall of the western addition. Ms. Lecky was opposed to the demolition due to the condition of the building stating that repair was possible.

Ms. Galke stated that the fire damage is significant and lack of a footer concerns her. The lack of routine maintenance and neglect has resulted in severe deterioration to portions of the structure. Ms. Galke stated her support of the proposed replacement windows. The scale and massing of the addition competes with the primary structure and the overall scale is a concern.

Ms. Ross stated that the additions were built after the primary structure and they don't quite match the level of craftsmanship of the original structure. This Federal-style building is a hallmark of the Ellis brothers. She agreed with the staff recommendation for the approval of the request to remove the rear additions. Ms. Ross stated that she was alright with the western wall removal. The window replacement proposal was an appropriate solution that retains the main historic fabric.

Vice Chair Moss requested additional documentation for the window inventory so the Board can better understand the condition of the windows and the deterioration. She was opposed to the demolition of an entire addition when preservation is possible. The scale and massing of the new addition overwhelm the original structure. The new proposed windows on the new addition should align with the existing windows in regards to residential style, spacing, and materials.

Mr. Jarrell suggested that a work session would be beneficial. Ms. Schwartz confirmed the Board is scheduled for February 27; however, the agenda is quite full already. It would be beneficial to schedule this application for an additional work session at a later date. Ms. Schwartz will coordinate a date with the Board through email.

Ms. Lecky motioned to approve the replacement of the windows at this residence due to the substantial level of deterioration with aluminum-clad wood Marvin Ultimate Double Hung Insert G2 replacement units as submitted. Mr. Jarrell seconded and the motion carried 5-1, with Vice Chair Moss against.

Ms. Penick motioned to continue the remainder of COA FY23-0010 – 301-303 Hanover Street to the next meeting with a work session date to be determined. Mr. Jarrell seconded and the motion carried 6-0.

#### New Applications

- B. COA FY23-0033 – 507 Caroline Street – JFH-Fredericksburg III, LLC requests to make alterations to this single-family attached residence including replacing some windows, siding, and roofing, and constructing a rear addition.

Mr. Jarrell recused himself from this item. Ms. Schwartz provided an overview of the application. Mr. Joshua Grady was present to answer questions.

Ms. Peckler (HFFI) spoke in support of the application. HFFI holds an easement on the property and they have also approved the current proposal.

Ms. Penick voiced support of the application. She asked the applicant why the rear windows could not be more similar to existing windows in shape and size. Mr. Grady said they can be more consistent. Ms. Penick said if the windows were consistent it would blend with original design. Ms. Lecky agreed with staff recommendations and Ms. Penick's comments.

Ms. Galke expressed support of the application and agreed with the staff recommendations. The shed dormer is a clever solution to the head room issue that is presented by the current low ceiling in the attic at the head of the stairs. The proposed addition is appropriately sized in relation to the original structure. Ms. Galke agreed that the existing metal roof needs to be replaced. The application is sensitive to the criteria outlined in the Historic District Design Guidelines.

Ms. Ross and Vice Chair Moss agreed with the comments from the Board and the staff recommendations.

Ms. Galke motioned to approve COA FY23-0033 – 507 Caroline Street with the following conditions:

1. The new windows will be simulated divided lite units with spacer bars between the glass panes.
2. All standing seam metal roofing will have seams mechanically crimped on site.
3. Consistent, vertically-oriented proportions will be used for all new windows on the south side of the new addition.
4. An alternative siding material may be used for the lowest 1-2 courses of siding, especially in areas of ground contact, on condition that it matches the profile and appearance of the wood siding.
5. Replacement of the shutters on the front elevation is recommended.

Ms. Ross seconded and the motion carried 5-0-1, with Mr. Jarrell abstaining.

- C. COA FY23-0034 – 1102 Prince Edward Street – David Morgan requests to install flagstone over the concrete deck of the front porch at this single-family residence.

Ms. Schwartz provided an overview of the application. The representative, Timothy Dunn, was present to answer questions. This application did not receive any public comments.

Mr. Jarrell asked if the stone will be cut around the post. Mr. Dunn explained how the stone will be installed and sealed to prevent water damage to the wood. Ms. Penick asked the applicant how they will address the staff recommendation. The applicant will caulk the joints to allow for expansion and the bluestone will pull down to the front of the step to meet the sidewalk.

Ms. Lecky expressed concern regarding possible water damage to the wooden posts. She stated that if staff believes that the expansion joint is sufficient enough to prevent water damage, she is willing to support approval. Ms. Galke had no comments.

Ms. Ross had a few questions for the applicant regarding the design. Mr. Dunn clarified that the stone will be randomly sized and all the joints will be filled with minimally sized gaps in the mortar. Ms. Ross was in support of the application. Vice Chair Moss agreed.

Ms. Lecky motioned to approve COA FY23-0034 – 1102 Prince Edward Street with the condition that sufficient expansion gaps are provided around the wood posts and against the front wall of the house. Ms. Galke seconded and the motion carried 6-0.

- D. COA FY23-0035 – 210 Ferdinand Street – Donald Upperco, on behalf of Fredericksburg City Public Schools, requests to install accessory structures, including an all-ability playground and a sunshade over an outdoor classroom area at the Walker-Grant Center.

The applicant was present to answer questions. The Board did not have any questions or concerns and all were in support of the application.

Ms. Ross motioned to approve COA FY23-0035 – 210 Ferdinand Street as submitted. Mr. Jarrell seconded and the motion carried 6-0.

- E. COA FY23-0039 – 1311 Caroline Street – Steve D’Lugos requests to replace 14 wood windows at this single-family residence with Fibrex replacement units.

Ms. Schwartz provided an overview of the application. Tyler Crowley, Renewal by Andersen, was present to answer questions. The Board agreed with staff recommendation stating that the windows appear to be in repairable condition based on the submitted documents. The proposed Fibrex material for the replacement units is also not supported by the guidelines.

Mr. Jarrell motioned to deny COA FY23-0039 – 1311 Caroline Street because the request does not meet the Historic District Design Guidelines or the standards in City Code §72-23.1(D)(2), in particular standard 6. Ms. Penick seconded and the motion carried 6-0.

- F. COA FY23-0040 – 220 Princess Anne Street – Denise Malczewski requests to replace the shed in the rear yard of this single-family residence.

Ms. Malczewski was present to answer questions and requested a modification to this application to place the door on a different elevation. Mr. Jarrell stated that this is a reasonable modification and agreed with the staff recommendation to approve the application. All Board members agreed.

Ms. Lecky motioned to approve COA FY23-0040 – 220 Princess Anne Street as presented with the location of doors and windows on the east elevation modified. Ms. Galke seconded and the motion carried 6-0.

**GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT [01:54:56]**

Ms. Schwartz read a comment from Mr. Rains who spoke in opposition to COA FY23-0032 – 905 Princess Anne Street, St. George’s Episcopal Church. [See attached].

**OTHER BUSINESS [01:57:42]**

Ms. Schwartz provided an update on the proposed changes to the ARB Bylaws. It is scheduled to be adopted on March 13, 2023 by the Architectural Review Board.

Vice Chair Moss requested a status update regarding the Historic Preservation working group. Ms. Schwartz stated that she has been working with the City Manager, Mayor Greenlaw, and Councilman Kelly to establish a permanent standing committee for historic preservation. This structure will be presented to the City Council at a work session for discussion.

There will be a work session on February 27, 2023 at 5:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers.

**STAFF UPDATE**

None.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Vice Chair Moss adjourned the meeting at 9:05 p.m.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Karen Irvin, Chair

TO: Members of the Architectural Review Board  
City of Fredericksburg

RE: COA FY23-0032  
St. George's Episcopal Church  
901 Princess Anne Street

DATE: February 13, 2023

I am Craig Rains. I live at 204 Fairway Drive, Locust Grove, VA 22508. I have been an active member of St. George's Episcopal Church for more than 20 years. Along with our spiritual charges, I believe it is our duty as members of St. George's to be caretakers of the historic facilities and graveyard for which we have been entrusted.

A sign installed over a hundred years ago at the gate to our graveyard reads: "THE FOUNDERS OF FREDERICKSBURG SLEEP HERE. 1732. A.P.V.A."

I am opposed to building a ramp across the church graveyard, which is one of the city's oldest cemeteries. As proposed, it would require (1) tearing out a large piece of the historic 1890s fence at the sidewalk, (2) destroying a piece of historic art and (3) knocking out a section of the wall of the historic church building..

Significantly, this proposed ramp plan would run directly over one of the most important gravesites — and the oldest for which we have a record — that of John Jones, recorded in 1752. If this is approved, that site would be lost forever.

It is sad to see this destruction at a time when we read about cemeteries being restored and preserved, like the one in Henrico County reported recently in the Free Lance-Star that had a sign reading "May they never be forgotten." Or the preservation of one

Page 2  
Architectural Review Board  
February 13, 2023

last month in Bowie, Maryland or the Georgetown cemetery, both reported recently in the Washington Post.

I am opposed to knocking a hole in a wall of the historic 1849 church building to insert a door. I am opposed to destroying a stained glass window that is one of a set of four windows installed in 1908-1909. The proposed plan shows the window being hacked in two with the wall below it being removed for the door to the cemetery ramp.

The building already has two handicap-accessible ADA-compliant doors that provide access to the building and to the lift. These doors are 10 feet from the sidewalk on the George Street side. To address the slope issue, there could be two Sunday-only accessible parking spaces reserved at those doors and a “greeter” could be stationed to assist, as is done now at the main entrance door to the narthex.

Presently, no breach of façades or side walls are visible from the street on any of the six historic church buildings in downtown Fredericksburg (Fredericksburg Baptist, Fredericksburg United Methodist, Presbyterian Church, Shiloh (New Site), Shiloh (Old Site), St. George’s). I hope that this will continue.

Thank you for your consideration.



Craig Rains  
204 Fairway Dr  
Locust Grove, VA 22508  
Email: craig.rains@att.net  
Cell/Text: (540) 903-2106