



Minutes
Architectural Review Board
February 11, 2019
Council Chambers, City Hall
Fredericksburg, Virginia

Members Present

Jonathan Gerlach, Chair
Sabina Weitzman
Kerri S. Barile
Karen Irvin
James Whitman

Members Absent

Carthon Davis, III, Vice Chair
Susan Pates

Staff

Kate Schwartz
Cathy Eckles

Mr. Gerlach called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

OPENING REMARKS

Mr. Gerlach determined that a quorum was present, and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz noted that they had.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Dr. Barile requested to add an item to the agenda under Other Business regarding an update on the various archaeological projects around town. Mr. Gerlach requested to add an item to the agenda under Other Business regarding activating the ARB Liaison Committee to interface with the Historic Fredericksburg Foundation, Inc. Ms. Weitzman motioned to approve the agenda as amended. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Gerlach asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the regular meeting dated January 14, 2019. Dr. Barile motioned to make a change to page four, second paragraph from the bottom, third sentence, previously ending in "some possible amendments to the motion" to add the wording, "specifically regarding the brick arches on the primary elevation." Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the amended minutes. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had engaged in any *ex parte* communication on any item before the Board. No Board members had any *ex parte* communications to report.

DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board. Mr. Gerlach stated he had a conflict with COA 2019-02, 600 Caroline Street, as his law firm represents the building owner and recused himself from the matter.

PUBLIC HEARING

- A. New Business**
Signs

For the shed, Ms. Colombo noted that they could extend the shed by two feet in order to make it rectangular. She said they would also be willing to use a board-and-batten style door. Ms. Weitzman noted that the shed was nicely conceived, and care had been taken in the material selection. She said it does not have a squat appearance and doesn't believe it needs the additional two feet; however, she was willing to support it as an option. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the shed with the option to extend the length an additional two feet and on condition that board-and-batten style doors are used. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

The Board discussed elements of the proposed sign, including the use of PVC material and eliminating the recessed panels on the posts. Ms. Colombo noted that they could use a Hardie/fiber cement type material instead, but they were avoiding brick as it would be so hard to match the historic building. Ms. Weitzman asked if the posts would have crisp corners, as this was often where PVC fails as a material. Ms. Colombo said the corners were sharp.

Dr. Barile said she supported the use of smooth posts, without panels, but would have liked to see a material sample. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the sign on condition that the recessed panels on the posts are eliminated. Ms. Irvin seconded. Dr. Barile discussed the material again with Mr. Gerlach and Ms. Peckler and asked if the material could be painted. Ms. Colombo confirmed that it could. Ms. Weitzman amended her motion to add the condition that the posts have a painted finish. Ms. Irvin seconded the amended motion. The motion carried 5-0.

- iv. **COA 2017-80** – 1201 Caroline Street – The City of Fredericksburg Public Works Department requests to modify the previously approved masonry dumpster enclosure in the rear parking lot by increasing the length and height of the walls.

Ray Regan, Director of Public Facilities, was present to represent the application. There was no public comment.

Ms. Irvin and Ms. Weitzman discussed where the gates would be located and how they would be used. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the application as presented. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

Exterior Alterations/Additions

- v. **COA 2019-03** – 821 Caroline Street – Edward Wright, Jr. requests to make alterations to this commercial building including painting the concrete rear wall, replacing the canvas awning, replacing tile on the building façade, and installing window and awning signs for the Abner B's Ice Cream business.

The applicant, Ed Wright, was present. Mr. Wright said he was looking to replace the tile with yellow and white tile to match the company colors. He had no objection to the style, only to the colors. He also noted that he would be meeting with Kathy Frazier through the Main Street Design Assistance program tomorrow.

There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile said that she concurs with the staff report and believes that the tile is a character-defining feature. The tile reflects the historic fabric, rather than a specific tenant. Mr. Gerlach and Mr. Irvin both agreed and said that the tile is a feature that should be preserved. Ms. Weitzman agreed and noted that she thought Frazier can help make the tile work for Mr. Wright's business.

Weitzman said that a simple shed-style roof may be more appropriate. She also noted that this might be an opportunity for a contemporary design that would never be mistaken for the original.

Ms. Irvin said that the two-story porch on the proposed addition refers to more traditional detailing, and she would want to see more contemporary vocabulary throughout. She said she supported the use of a simple shed roof. Dr. Barile agreed and said that a very shallow shed would be similar to the earlier porch, but different enough to not be confused for the same one. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the addition of a porch roof on condition that it has a shallow-pitched shed-style roof. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

Mr. Gerlach complimented the design of the new addition and said that it pays homage to the historic fabric without being falsely historical. Dr. Barile complimented the maintenance of the historic fenestration.

Mr. Gerlach asked for clarification of where the Boral material would be used. Mr. Tucker said it would be used only for trim elements and would not be used to hold weight. Dr. Barile asked for confirmation that the metal roof would be crimped on site. Mr. Tucker said that it would. Ms. Weitzman clarified that the spaces between the porch piers would be open. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the rear addition as presented with the recommendation that the applicants monitor for archaeological deposits during construction and report any findings to City staff. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- viii. COA 2019-06 – 309 Caroline Street – William Tucker requests to make alterations to the detached garage building, including constructing a two-story rear addition and replacing the garage doors with new doors and windows.**

The applicant, Bill Tucker, was present. Mr. Tucker said the addition was planned to be as far back from the street as possible. The intention is to build from the existing walls of the rear section of the garage, but they may be de facto demolished and rebuilt depending on condition.

There was no public comment.

Ms. Weitzman and Ms. Irvin discussed the depiction of rooflines in the submitted drawings and the interaction with neighboring properties to determine if they were shown accurately. Mr. Tucker agreed that there was an error in the drawing, but noted that the new second story addition would be behind the neighboring structure on Frederick Street.

Mr. Gerlach asked for confirmation of the overall height and asked if it would be lower than the main house. Mr. Tucker confirmed that it would. Mr. Gerlach also asked Mr. Tucker if the staff recommendations were acceptable to him. He agreed that they were. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the application with the conditions recommended by staff:

1. The windows will be constructed of wood with optional aluminum cladding and with true or simulated divided lights. If simulated, spacer bars will be included between the glass panes.
2. The garage doors and entry door will be constructed of wood with optional aluminum cladding.
3. All trim elements will be constructed of wood to match the existing structure.

Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

COMMITTEE UPDATE

There were no updates from committees.

CHAIRMAN'S REPORT

The chairman had nothing further to report.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 9:11 p.m.



Jonathan Gerlach, ARB Chair