



Minutes
Architectural Review Board
January 8, 2018
Council Chambers, City Hall
Fredericksburg, Virginia

Members Present

Jonathan Gerlach, Chair
Sabina Weitzman, Vice Chair
Susan Pates
Kerri S. Barile
Carthon Davis, III
Karen Irvin
James Whitman

Members Absent

Staff

Kate Schwartz
Camilla Jacobs

Ms. Weitzman called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

OPENING REMARKS

Ms. Weitzman determined that a quorum of seven members was present and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz stated that they had.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the agenda as written. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

ELECTIONS

Dr. Barile made a motion to nominate Jonathan Gerlach as Chair and Sabina Weitzman as Vice Chair. Mr. Davis seconded. The motion carried unanimously. Mr. Gerlach took over as Chair of the meeting.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to nominate Jonathan Gerlach as the ARB representative to the City Public Utility Review Committee. Mr. Davis seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Gerlach asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the public hearing dated December 11, 2017. There were no changes or additions. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the minutes as written. Mr. Davis seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had engaged in any *ex parte* communication on any item before the Board. No Board members had any *ex parte* communications to report.

DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board.

Ms. Weitzman referenced COA 2017-97 at 919 Caroline Street and said she was the architect for another project in the same building.

PUBLIC HEARING

A. Continued Items

- i. **COA 2017-94 – 303½ Caroline Street** - Cliff Morrissett requests to replace the existing vinyl windows with new composite-frame windows at this single-family residence.

Cliff Morrissett, from Renewal by Andersen, was present to represent the applicant. There was no public comment.

Ms. Weitzman thanked staff for researching the product and finding out how other communities have approached the material. She said she believes the window policy is clear and said she does not believe they are imposing a hardship through the requirement to use a wood or clad wood window. Ms. Pates and Dr. Barile agreed.

Mr. Gerlach asked if the applicant was able to commit to the alternate material condition as he is not the owner of the building. Ms. Schwartz noted that the approval would run with the property. You could approve the application for replacement with the material condition which would remain valid for this address.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness on condition that an alternate material that aligns with the district guidelines is selected. The new windows must be one over one, solid wood, double hung sash windows and may include exterior aluminum or vinyl cladding. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

B. New Business

Signs

- i. **COA 2017-97 – 919 Caroline Street** – Frank Robinson requests to install signs, including one projecting sign, and building-mounted sconces for the Curitiba Art Café business.

Patric Ross, the sign designer, was present to represent the applicant. There was no public comment.

Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the sign as submitted. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 6-0-1, with Ms. Weitzman abstaining.

- ii. **COA 2017-99 – 1011 Caroline Street** – Kristen Sill requests to install signs, including one projecting sign and one building-mounted sign, for the Connect Games Escape Room business.

The applicant was present. There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile noted that the signage total is very close to the maximum allowed for the building and confirmed that the applicant was aware of this.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the sign as submitted. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

Accessory Structures/Exterior Alterations

iii. **COA 2017-96 – 1201 Caroline Street** – The City of Fredericksburg requests to install a 30-foot tall metal flag pole at the Central Rappahannock Regional Library Headquarters.

The applicant was not present. There was no public comment.

Mr. Davis said that he believed the finish color of the pole should be a condition rather than a recommendation. The increased cost was not a substantial reason to avoid requiring this. Ms. Weitzman commented that this was a different issue than paint color because it is the permanent material finish. Ms. Weitzman asked how the height of the pole had been chosen. Ms. Schwartz said it was a standard dimension that was within the height limit for this zoning district.

Dr. Barile made a recommendation that archaeologists complete a test unit at the site rather than monitor during installation. She said the required hole was approximately the same size as a test unit and this is a known archaeological site. This was the site of the 18th-century Ross House, and there are known intact deposits there.

Ms. Weitzman asked what others thought about the color of the pole. She noted that an anodized aluminum finish was typical for a flag pole. Mr. Davis said an anodized aluminum finish would be more visible from a distance. Ms. Irvin asked if the finish would be integral to the pole. Ms. Schwartz confirmed that it would.

Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the application on condition that a black or dark finish is used and with the recommendation that a professional archaeologist excavate the necessary hole as a test unit before the pole is installed due to known intact deposits. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

iv. **COA 2017-98 – 909 Sophia Street** – Charles Stevens requests to install a metal-framed storefront system in the existing garage door opening on the front elevation and install mechanical equipment on the rear elevation.

The applicant, Charles Stevens, was present. There was no public comment. Mr. Stevens said he would save the current door by locking it in place in the open position.

Ms. Weitzman asked if the new equipment would impact the stairs that they had approved at the rear of the building. The applicant stated that those have already been installed and the new equipment would not be in the way.

Mr. Gerlach asked if the door would still be functional. The applicant stated that it would remain in the locked position, but could be used if the storefront were later removed.

Mr. Davis asked the applicant if he considered adding any support or additional bracing to the original door to ensure it doesn't sag in the raised position. The applicant said it will be secured and they appreciate the recommendation.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the proposal as presented with the following conditions: the metal framing should match the framing of the existing windows as closely as possible, and product specifications for the storefront must be provided to staff for verification prior to the issuance of a building permit. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

Exterior Alterations

- v. **COA 2017-68 – 312 Sophia Street** – Kim and Tommy Mitchell request to modify the approved Certificate of Appropriateness to install new doors for this residential property with a change to the design of the doors and transoms.

The applicant, Kim Mitchell, 100 Frederick Street, was present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Irvin asked if the chimney was being removed entirely. Ms. Mitchell said they would be installing a fireplace insert with a mechanical vent in place of the chimney.

Ms. Weitzman said she understood the desire to eliminate the transoms, but thought the alternate design was overly complicated and distracts from the simplicity of the structure. She said she would support full-view doors with no interior divisions. Dr. Barile asked the applicant if they were open to this design. Ms. Mitchell said they were trying to make the building look less commercial and more like a residence. Discussion continued about the windows and glass doors.

Discussion continued regarding the additional lighting. Ms. Weitzman asked why they had selected the number and placement of lights. Ms. Mitchell said that section of street is very dark and they were hoping to provide extra light, but she was willing to reduce the total number. Mr. Gerlach asked how many lights she would need to provide adequate lighting. Ms. Mitchell said she would need lights at each door and on the stairs, approximately 8 - 10 lights.

Dr. Barile noted that the lights don't impact any character-defining features of the building and thanked the applicant for responding quickly with revisions.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the application with the following conditions: no chimney is included; light fixtures will be as shown in revised elevations submitted on January 5, 2018; and the proposed doors do not include divided lights or transoms. Dr. Barile seconded. Ms. Irvin made a friendly amendment to use Option A for the light fixtures. Ms. Weitzman and Dr. Barile accepted the amendment.

Ms. Pates suggested a friendly amendment to allow the applicant a choice on the door design. Dr. Barile seconded. Board members discussed whether or not the rhythm of divisions was appropriate for the building.

Ms. Weitzman withdrew her original motion.

Ms. Mitchell suggested that the doors include a horizontal muntin near the top, but no vertical division, to match the height of the original doors. The Board said they supported this option. Ms. Schwarz suggested motion to approve the revisions in accordance with the drawings submitted January 5, 2018 with light fixture Option A and with the change in the door design to allow one horizontal rail but no vertical rails.

Ms. Weitzman made the motion to approve the application for exterior alterations at 312 Sophia Street in accordance with the revised elevations dated January 5, 2018 with the following conditions: light fixture option (A) is used; there is no chimney as shown; and the divided lights in the doors are limited to a single horizontal rail at the height of the original doors. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 7-0.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

OTHER BUSINESS

- A. Transmittal of Planning Commission Agenda for January 10, 2018
- B. Transmittal of Certified Local Government 2016-2017 Annual Report
- C. Review of Draft Text Amendments to §72-23.1 Historic District – Certificates of Appropriateness, §72-34.1 Old and Historic Fredericksburg District, amendments to the Procedures Manual, and revised Certificate of Appropriateness application form

Ms. Pates asked if the removal of paint should be added to the list of items that require a COA. Ms. Schwartz said that it would be considered an exterior alteration as the code is written now.

Ms. Pates said that she believed community ownership was an important aspect of the historic district and that public participation was vital. She said all items should have a regular public hearing. Mr. Davis also said that he doesn't agree with streamlining the process and thinks public notice is very important. Mr. Gerlach agreed that the public should have the opportunity to comment on all applications.

Ms. Weitzman noted that she had never seen a public comment on the items recommended for administrative review. She said she believed staff was capable of handling these items. Dr. Barile noted that she was in the middle on this issue, but was concerned about the public notice aspect.

The Board decided to hold a work session to discuss these items further on January 22, 2018 at 7 p.m.

- D. Introduction to New Board Members

Mr. Gerlach welcomed the new board members and all members introduced themselves.

ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Davis made a motion to adjourn. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried 7-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:56 p.m.



Jonathan Gerlach, ARB Chair

