



Minutes
Architectural Review Board
September 20, 2021
Council Chambers

You may view and listen to the Architectural Review Board meeting in its entirety [here](#). The time of each presentation is in brackets below [0:00].

Members Present

Jonathan Gerlach, Chair
Karen Irvin, Vice Chair
Laura Galke
Helen P. Ross
Sabina Weitzman

Members Absent

James Whitman
Adriana Moss

Staff

Chuck Johnston
Taylor Owen

Chairman Gerlach called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

OPENING REMARKS [00:00:11]

Chairman Gerlach determined that a quorum of five members was present and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Mr. Johnston confirmed that they had.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA [00:01:50]

Mr. Johnston recommended deferral on the sign installation at 1014 Prince Edward Street.
Ms. Weitzman requested to add an item to the agenda for discussion. Chairman Gerlach added the item, 11A – Documentation of ARB Applications, under Other Business

Ms. Ross motioned to approve the amended agenda. Ms. Weitzman seconded and the motion carried with a vote of 5-0.

REVIEW OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

None

DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST [00:04:18]

Ms. Weitzman disclosed a conflict of interest for 402 Hanover Street, and removed herself from discussion of this item (Item 9D – COA FY-22-0014). [Attachment 1 – Disclosure Form, S. Weitzman]
Chairman Gerlach disclosed a conflict of interest for 1205 Charles Street, and removed himself from discussion of this item (Item 9E – COA FY-22-0015). [Attachment 2 – Disclosure Form, J. Gerlach]

CONSENT AGENDA [00:05:47]

- A. ~~COA FY-22-0007 – 708 Prince Edward Street – Additional AC unit~~ Moved to public hearing.
- B. COA FY-22-0008 – 620 Princess Anne Street – Sign Installation
- C. COA FY-22-0009 – 502 Sophia Street, Suite A & B – Sign Installation

~~D. COA FY-22-0012 – 401 Princess Anne Street – Fence Installation Moved to public hearing.~~

~~E. COA FY-22-0017 – 1014 Prince Edward Street – Sign Installation Removed~~

F. COA FY-22-0018 – 403 William Street – Sign Installation

Chairman Gerlach stated that because the HFFI (Historic Fredericksburg Foundation, Inc.) had submitted a public comment in reference to 1014 Prince Edward Street (COA FY-22-0007) they would automatically remove the item from the consent agenda. Mr. Johnston then recommended that the application be removed completely since the application proposed to add a sign to a fence that did not have previous permitting. The applicants will need to resubmit for both the fence and the sign for the October meeting.

Ms. Irvin asked to remove two other applications from the consent agenda: 708 Prince Edward Street (COA FY-22-0007) and 401 Princess Anne Street (COA FY-22-0012). These two items were removed from the consent agenda and added to Public Hearings as items 9H and 9I.

Chairman Gerlach asked if there had been a public comment regarding the three remaining consent items: 620 Princess Anne Street, 502 Sophia Street, and 403 William Street. Mr. Johnston confirmed that there were no public comments received for these three items.

After Mr. Johnston presented these three items, Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve items B (COA FY-22-0008), C (COA FY-22-0009), and F (COA FY-22-0018) Ms. Weitzman seconded the motion. The motion carried with a vote of 5-0 – items B, C and F were approved on consent.

PUBLIC HEARING [00:11:48]

A. COA FY-22-0001 – 715 Caroline Street - 715 Caroline Street, LLC (owner: Tommy Mitchell Leasing) requests to replace the existing front entry door with a new full-view, wood door.

The applicant for COA FY-22-0001 – 715 Caroline Street was not present. Mr. Johnston and Chairman Gerlach discussed the applicant who was not notified properly. The Historic Fredericksburg Foundation, Inc. (HFFI) sent in a comment regarding the property. (Attachment 3) Chairman Gerlach suggested they vote to continue with this application during the next meeting. Ms. Weitzman voted to continue until the next meeting and was seconded by Ms. Galke. The motion carried 5-0.

B. COA FY-22-0010 – 1318 Caroline Street - James McGhee (owners: Megan and Michael Waite) requests to add an approximate 420 sq. ft., single-story rear addition.

Mr. Johnston recommended to approve the application but there is an issue regarding setbacks for the property which is zoned R4. There is a calculation to determine setbacks based on maps of the properties in the area and the Zoning Administrator determined that there should be a 4 ft. setback in the North side and a 2 ft. setback on the South side. Mr. Johnston suggested they revisit the setback with the zoning administrator during a field verification, and at least a 2 ft. setback on either sides to be up to code.

The applicant sent in a presentation which Mr. Johnston shared. The applicants do not plan to construct a second floor over the new addition but the current plans accommodate that possibility in the future. The applicant shared their concerns about rainwater and plan to utilize the City storm

draining system with subterranean drains which will be directed into city sewers. The applicant also shared that the materials they plan to use are Hardie plank, synthetic trim, and metal.

A written comment was submitted by the HFFI stating that they concur with staff recommendation.

Ms. Irvin asked how old the existing porch was. Mr. McGhee estimated it was done after 1964. The porch is not visible from the public right of way due to the fence. Ms. Ross asked if a 2 ft. setback isn't sufficient for the project, would he consider a variance. Mr. McGhee said he might. Ms. Weitzman requested clarification on the setbacks and the materials of the porch. Mr. McGhee stated that they would use synthetic trim and Hardie plank. They also discussed the mechanics of building an additional structure to the house and how they would access the property with the addition taking up so much space. They were granted access by the neighbors. Chair Gerlach believed that the application meets their guidelines.

Ms. Galke made a motion to approve the application as amended on condition that there will be a minimum 2 ft. setback from the property boundary on the north and south side per City Code. The motion was seconded by Ms. Ross and carried 5-0.

- C. COA FY-22-0011 – 520 Caroline Street - Nathanael Ulfers (owner: Stone Holdings, LLC; Agora Downtown Coffee Shop) requests to replace the eastern most window on the south face to match adjacent windows in size, proportion, and style.

A written comment was submitted by the HFFI stating that they oppose the application because it does not meet the guidelines.

The representative, Mr. Ulfers, was present. The purpose of the proposed walk up window is to accommodate both clients and employees when operating during a pandemic to maintain a safe distance. Mr. James McGhee spoke stating that he knew the architect, John Ballentine, that worked on this property previously and Mr. McGhee said that to his recollection, the windows were not there originally. A representative from HFFI, Danae Peckler, was present and she presented a case against this application by providing a brief history and stated that she was open to answer any questions.

There was a discussion on the current functionality of the window in the current context of the business. Both Chairman Gerlach and Ms. Weitzman were against the application. Ms. Irvin said that they could provide them the opportunity to wait to vote on the application to address the concerns of the Historic Fredericksburg Foundation and the ARB.

Ms. Irvin made the motion to defer a vote on this application until the October 11th meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Galke. The motion carried 5-0.

- D. COA FY-22-0014 – 402 Hanover Street – Jonathan Mozena and Anna Mitsis (owner: same) request to remove the existing rear addition and to add an approximate 2150 sq. ft., two-story rear addition.

Ms. Weitzman recused herself from the application and discussion. Chairman Gerlach and Ms. Irvin wanted to know more about the details of demolition plans and the building materials. Ms. Irvin asked if Ms. Mitsis would be alright with waiting on a vote until they could get more information regarding the project from the applicant, architect, and contractor. Ms. Mitsis agreed. Ms. Irvin

made a motion to defer this application to the next regular meeting and Ms. Galke seconded. The motion carried 4-0-1 (Weitzman abstaining).

- E. COA FY-22-0015 – 1205 Charles Street - Dolores Lecky (owner: same) requests to replace asbestos roof with asphalt shingles and replace aluminum gutters.

A written comment was submitted by the HFFI stating that they were concerned for how the fans may impact the historic house.

Ms. Weitzman was in support of the application and gave the applicant advice to use a color other than black. She said to be careful with the mechanical ventilation in the attic and it's more important to have outlets and inlets. Ms. Galke agreed with HFFI's comment and expressed concern about the fans impact on the house. Mr. Johnston said that they could look into it. Ms. Irvin seconded Ms. Weitzman's concern for the color choice, that black will build up heat and recommended a lighter color.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the amended application with the recommendation to select shingles of a lighter color than black, six inch aluminum gutters and the condition that the ventilation will be reviewed and approved by Mr. Johnston to assure that the historic fabric of the house isn't adversely impacted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Ross. The motion carried 4-0-1 (Gerlach abstaining).

- F. COA FY-22-0016 – 400-402 William Street - LaMacchia Group, LLC (for Citizens & Farmers Bank) (owner: E.D. Cole Building, LLC) requests to add signage, replace the awning, add a sign on the awning, and add an Automated Teller Machine.

A written comment was submitted by the HFFI stating that the proposed design does not meet the guidelines.

The applicant's representative was present. The applicant stated that they will be retaining the doors and storefront and withdrawing that request from the application. They will need to abate the lead paint. They plan to use the existing doors but want to leave that option open. They have been victim of several robberies and are making safety a priority.

Ms. Irvin and Ms. Weitzman were in support. There was a discussion on the lead paint. Ms. Ross inquired about the installation of security cameras. The applicant said they were willing to compromise a bit from a security standpoint due to the Historic District standards.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the application excluding any changes to the windows and doors, which were withdrawn. The motion was seconded by Ms. Irvin. Mr. Johnston added that they should include a condition that the projecting sign design is subject to dimensional, material, and lighting regulations of the City. They all accepted the addition to the motion. The motion carried 5-0.

Mr. Johnston questioned if there will be lighting under the awning where the ATM is located. The applicant said they don't currently see a need for that because there is already sufficient lighting and a camera in the ATM. Ms. Weitzman said that the handbook has a section on lighting the applicant can refer to.

G. COA FY-22-0007 – 708 Prince Edward Street – Additional AC unit next to an existing unit.

Ms. Irvin pulled the item from the consent agenda because she believed that there needs to be a condition to require sufficient screening from view. The Board agreed.

Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the application with the condition that both units are fully screened from view. Ms. Weitzman seconded and the motion carried 5-0.

H. COA FY-22-0012 – 401 Princess Anne Street – Fence Installation

Mr. Johnston did not receive any public comments for this item. Ms. Weitzman pulled this item because the white fence doesn't match the brick industrial building and thinks that the proposed fence belongs in a more residential area. She said that a dog-eared solid board fence would be more appropriate. Ms. Ross agreed and suggested the applicant consider another option. Mr. Johnston asked if he should suggest a typical black aluminum fence or a shorter version of the fence that they are using for the doors for the trash enclosure. Chairman Gerlach said he was in support of another choice.

Ms. Ross asked if they will be painting some lettering on the western-facing façade of the building. Chairman Gerlach said they don't have jurisdiction over paint, which Ms. Ross verified that she only wanted to know what they were planning, not to enforce anything. Mr. Johnston suggested splitting the item into item 0012A and 0012B.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the application COA FY-22-0012A – 401 Princess Anne Street for a dumpster enclosure. Ms. Irvin seconded and the motion carried 5-0.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to continue COA FY-22-0012B – 401 Princess Anne Street until the next meeting. Ms. Galke seconded and the motion carried 5-0.

I. COA FY-22-0017 – 1014 Prince Edward Street – Sign Installation

Mr. Johnston recommends that the Board take no action this evening because the applicant will need to resubmit due to the fencing which was not previously approved. Mr. Johnston said he would need to speak to Ms. Marne Sherman to clarify some sign regulations.

A written comment was submitted by the HFFI stating that they were against the application and requests that it be continued to a later meeting.

Ms. Ross made a motion to continue the application to October 11th. The motion was seconded by Ms. Weitzman. The motion carried 5-0.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT [\[01:57:23\]](#)

None

OTHER BUSINESS

A. Documentation of ARB Applications

Ms. Weitzman said that she would like to have submitted plans be enhanced so that they can read them in order to make determinations. Mr. Johnston agreed with her comments. There was a discussion on the size of documentation submitted in applications to the ARB. Applicants need to be notified to submit as much information as possible.

STAFF UPDATE [02:07:00]

There are now printed guidelines available. Mr. Johnston reminded the ARB that the site visit supplementary meeting will take place on the vacant lot to the left of Abner's Ice Cream and the right of the Thai place on Caroline Street. The applicant is interested in building a multi-story structure with a retail ground floor. The application introduces interesting questions on height. They may need to consider the heights of historic buildings that have been demolished previously and include that in the new guidelines.

The second item for discussion is Water's End Brewery. The applicant is considering purchasing the Fredericksburg Square property across from Agora at 525 Caroline Street. They intend to use the location for a brewery, restaurant, and to host weddings and events. The left pedestrian walkway would remain open, and they plan to renovate the back area into an outdoor beer garden. They intend to build a single-story, small-scale brewery building with a modern design. Mr. Johnston said the alley is narrow but very visible.

ANNOUNCEMENTS AND REPORTS

None

ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Gerlach adjourned the meeting at 9:13 p.m.



Karen Irvin, Chair